



Making the Most of It

Further Appraisal of Additional Facilities within the Grove Wellbeing Centre

1. Introduction

1.1 Background

In November 2010 Deloitte MCS Ltd submitted a final report to Belfast City Council (the Council) for approval of an economic appraisal for the provision of additional facilities within the Grove Wellbeing Centre.

This appraisal gave due consideration to the proposals for a ten-pin bowling alley as well as a large number of alternative options. Table 1.1 summarises the results of the quantitative and qualitative analysis of the short-listed options, ranking them accordingly.

Table 1.1 Options Appraisal Summary

Option Description	Monetary Costs/Benefits		Non-Monetary Costs/Benefits		Cost per Non-Monetary Score	
	NPC £'000	Rank	Score	Rank	£'000	Rank
1 Do Nothing	0	1	0	6	0	n/a
2 Ten Pin Bowling	262,327	5	755	5	347.5	4
3 Martial Arts	66,907	4	765	4	87.5	3
4 Interactive Youth Space	317,143	6	865	3	366.6	5
5a Mixed Use (Interactive & Martial Arts)	63,752	3	945	1	67.5	2
5b Mixed Use (Interactive & Martial Arts) - Split Level	39,554	2	945	1	41.9	1

Source: Deloitte

The results showed that Option 5b (mixed use, split level) had the lowest Net Present Cost (NPC) of the 'do something' options but also scored highest on the non-monetary assessment together with Option 5a. A comparison of the cost per non-monetary score showed Option 5b as having lowest cost per point scored than the other options.

The most expensive option in terms of NPC was Option 4 (interactive youth space) with a NPC of £317,143. However, this scored second best in the non-monetary scoring, after the mixed use options but the cost per non-monetary score for Option 4 ranked lowest.

Option 2 (ten pin bowling) is the most expensive in this regard and scored lowest of the 'do something' options in terms of non-monetary benefit. It also had the second highest NPC.

1.2 Preferred Option and Recommendations

In assessing the balance of advantage between the options, Option 5b – Mixed Use (Interactive Youth and Martial Arts – split level) with an NPC of £39,554 and the highest non-monetary score, was identified as the preferred option for implementation. Its cost per monetary score was 60% less than the equivalent for Option 5a and almost nine times less than Option 2 (ten pin bowling).

In taking this option forward it was recommended that further technical advice be obtained both in terms of:

- understanding the practicalities of a split level solution (for example, compliance with Disability Discrimination Act regulations); and
- ensuring the design of the new facilities meet current fire regulations¹.

1.3 October 2011 Update

In the interim period since the submission of the economic appraisal the Council has given due consideration to the outcome of the assessment process. At the Parks and Leisure Committee, September 2011, Members agreed that further consultation should be undertaken with the North Belfast Councillors. In preparation for this meeting Officers asked for some additional research to be undertaken to provide greater assurance that martial arts use is appropriate for the Grove Well Being Centre.

This briefing note summarises the additional consultation undertaken with key stakeholders to gain insight as to how the option of a dedicated martial arts space would work in practice.

Key stakeholders consulted with included:

- Sport Northern Ireland;
- Various Martial Arts Governing Bodies;
- Grove Wellbeing Centre Management; and
- Local Councillors.

The remainder of this briefing note summarises the main findings from the additional consultation.

¹ An additional £20,000 contingency cost was included in the cost assessment to allow for the eventuality of further work being required to ensure the additional facilities meet fire regulations.

2. Additional Consultation

2.1 Sport NI

Stakeholder: Sport NI

Date: 17/10/2011

Contact: Marc Scott

Sport NI advised that 'martial arts' is a collective term for a variety of codified practices and traditions of combat sport. Participants take up martial arts for numerous reasons including, self-defence, competition, physical fitness and health as well as mental / spiritual development. The main martial arts in Northern Ireland include:

- Judo;
- Taekwondo;
- Karate;
- Aikido;
- Jujitsu; and
- Chinese Associated Martial Arts.

Due to the fragmented number of martial arts bodies Sport NI will only recognise those that have official governing bodies. The recognised governing bodies for martial arts are as follows:

- NI Aikido Association - <http://www.aikido-baa.org.uk/>
- National Chinese and Associated Martial Arts – <http://bccma.com/>
- Northern Ireland JuJitsu Association – <http://www.jujitsuireland.com>
- Northern Ireland Judo Federation - <http://nijudo.com/>
- Northern Ireland Karate Board – <http://www.nikb.org/>
- Taekwondo Association of Northern Ireland - <http://www.tani.org.uk/>

The NI Karate Board is a federated body of four disciplines of karate and is currently recognised by Sport NI as the governing body for karate. However, Sport NI is aware of a further organisation, Karate Union GB, who governs Shotokan Karate and provided contact details for this organisation.

Having identified the governing bodies for each of the main martial arts disciplines Deloitte contacted representatives for the most popular of these bodies in order to establish:

- background information;
- what requirements the sport would have for using a space such as that available at the Grove;
- how they view the Grove as a potential location; and
- what opportunities a dedicated martial arts space in the Grove would provide.

2.2 Jujitsu Ireland

Stakeholder: Jujitsu Ireland Date: 20/10/2011 Contact: David Tony	
Background Information	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 90 clubs province wide with clubs throughout Belfast • Clubs run from sports centres and schools • Professional coaches • 3,500 members in Northern Ireland (largest martial arts organisation in Northern Ireland) • Approx 70% aged 5-14, 30% Adult, 70% male, 30% female (normal split for martial arts)
Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Matted area, size of badminton court or bigger • Suggested that competition Judo mats (4mm) can be used by all martial art disciplines • Would like the use of kick pads, focus pads and boxing gloves etc.
Grove as location	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not a barrier in a religious sense, have many examples of people training in both protestant and catholic areas and travelling into other areas to train. • Would need to be sure that there was a population to sustain use of Grove • Wouldn't operate within the Grove at the cost to other Belfast clubs
Opportunity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • If facility was there Jujitsu Ireland would examine operating a club from the Grove • Majority of classes are during the evening but professional coaches would also operate day time classes • Mentioned possibility of operating week-long self defence classes in school holidays etc.

2.3 Irish Karate

<p>Stakeholder: Irish Karate</p> <p>Date: 28/10/2011</p> <p>Contact: Oliver Brunton</p>	
Background Information	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 30 clubs across Northern Ireland ● Clubs are run from sports centres and community centres ● Approx. 1000 members, biggest Karate group in Northern Ireland ● Mixed with regard to sex and age breakdown
Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Better without mats ● Punch and kick bags ● Mirrors to observe stances etc ● Ventilation
Grove as location	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Would have no issue with the Grove as a location ● Other clubs in Belfast area ● Would operate in the Grove as well as existing clubs rather than instead of
Opportunity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Irish Karate would look at operating a club from within the Grove if the facilities existed ● They would use it as a new club location to expand the sport ● They would most likely operate it as a feeder club before directing people to their HQ club in Belfast for more specialist training

Issues

Oliver advised that the Lisburn Leisureplex attempted to set up a multi-discipline martial arts space in the past, however it was set up in a squash court and karate stopped using the facility as people couldn't observe/see what was going on and be attracted to the sport. There was also poor ventilation and a lack of mirrors.

Irish Karate have a headquarters located at 35 College Street Belfast. This HQ serves as their centre of excellence with members from clubs around the province travelling here to train. The HQ is open every day and has specialist coaches and equipment that "satellite clubs" do not. Oliver advised that if a club were to operate from the Grove it would be another satellite club.

2.4 Northern Ireland Judo Federation

Stakeholder: Northern Ireland Judo Federation

Date: 28/10/2011

Contact: Wendy Cooke

Background Information	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 66 judo clubs registered across Northern Ireland• Numbers to follow• 5 judo clubs in North Belfast
Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Ideally a sprung floor• Carpeted with double mats• Strike pads and bags
Grove as location	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Would have no issue with the Grove as a location• Other clubs in Belfast area• There is currently a club operating from the Grove and three clubs in local schools
Opportunity	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Promote junior participation in Judo in the North Belfast Area• Use for both NI Judo Federation Squad and Belfast Regional Development Squad• Host seminar and training events.

2.5 North Belfast Councillor Consultation

Stakeholder: Grove Management and Local Councillors

Date: 28/10/2011

As part of the consultation process it was important to talk with both the management of the Grove and North Belfast Councillors who represent the interests of the local population. To facilitate this a workshop session was held in the Grove Centre on Friday 28th November.

Attendees at this workshop were:

- Andrew Hassard – Director of Parks and Leisure;
 - Katrina Morgan – Leisure Operations Manager;
 - Adrian Walker – Leisure Manager
 - Councillor David Browne
-

- Councillor Pat Convery
- Councillor Lydia Patterson
- Richard Moore – Deloitte
- Jamie Mudge - Deloitte

The workshop commenced with a summary of Deloitte's findings and recommendations from the economic appraisal document. Richard Moore explained the overall process, including the rationale and evidence behind the shortlisted options was explained and the attendees given the opportunity to share their thoughts and ideas.

Several of the options that had been investigated as part of the economic appraisal were again considered, for example, simulated golf, interactive equipment. Evidence and reasoning as to why they had been discounted was provided as well as discussion on local demand for these type of activities and costs surrounding purchase, maintenance, income, replacement and staffing costs associated with supervising these activities.

Through the course of the workshop it became apparent that there was a concern from Councillors that a dedicated martial arts centre would not be the most effective facility for encouraging local people to use the leisure centre.

Discussion covered the proposals, local usage / interest in martial arts, city wide usage and potential displacement issues. An update was given in relation to the most recent contact with Sport NI and several martial arts clubs regarding using the space.

The group then considered a requirement to provide a facility for community use (with particular emphasis on the displaced youth club / community centre which was demolished to make way for the new Grove Well Being Centre). Various ideas were talked about including table tennis provision and youth interactive equipment.

It was suggested that an alternative part of GWBC (possibly Multi purpose room 2) could be utilised for community / youth club functions and the Department could purchase (out of £250k capital money) equipment for that purpose leaving the vacant space on the ground floor for martial arts functions.

It was suggested that the martial arts facility could be developed on a split level without the need for a costly sprung floor which could keep costs within budget.

Management were asked to look at current usage/ programming in Multi Purpose room 2 and identify availability for community usage. Approval was given for Officers to develop and bring back to P&L Committee the dual proposal of Martial arts provision on the ground floor and community usage in Multi purpose room 2.

Footnote:

After the workshop Deloitte met with local instructors for judo and wrestling who both gave their support for the martial arts use proposals, stating that they would hold classes at the Grove venue and saw it as an opportunity to grow participation numbers for their respective sports, particularly in North Belfast.
